



Cleveland Independent External Ethics Committee

Minutes

Date: 9th August 2023

Time: 16.00 – 18.30

Venue: Cleveland Police Central HQ / MS Teams

Attendees:

Name	Role
Dave Smith	Committee Chair
Sarah Soppitt	Committee Member
Paul D Woodvine	Committee Member
Craig Marshall	Committee Member
Lisa Ainsley	Cleveland Police
Elise Pout	OPCC
Neal Gillson	Sgt, Ethics Lead, DSE - Cleveland Police
Heidi Spencer	OPCC (Minutes)

Apologies:


Name	Role
Stuart Green	Committee Vice Chair
Tresor Bukasa	Committee Member
Tony Traynor	Committee Member
Jayden Foster	Committee Member – Provided written submissions
Shirley Johnston	Committee Member

Apologies not received:


Name	Role
Kahn Hanif	Committee Member

No.	Discussed
1	Welcome & Introduction DS welcomed everyone to the meeting and started with a round of introductions.

	It was explained that the meeting was being recorded to facilitate the minute taking.	
2	<p>Apologies for Absence</p> <p>Apologies for absence were noted.</p>	
3	<p>Declarations of Conflicts of Interest</p> <p>Members were reminded to declare any conflicts of interests at any points throughout the meeting.</p> <p>The importance of the confidential nature of the meeting was reinforced and it was re-emphasised that information discussed in the meeting should not be shared with other people and especially not on media outlets including social media.</p>	
4	<p>Minutes from meeting 13th June</p> <p>The minutes were agreed as an accurate record of the meeting held on the 13th June 2023. DS thanked Neal Gillson and Rachelle Kipling for providing some meeting notes to facilitate the minute writing. These were required because of recording/sound issues during the last meeting.</p> <p>The Committee is looking for new recruits to join the IEC. DS suggested that if any member knows anyone who might be interested in joining to please let DS/EP know. The OPCC will undertake further recruitment through their social media and their website.</p>	
5	<p>Ethical Submission 1.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Electrical Vehicle Charging <p>To discuss and, advise on, the most ethical and suitable use of the electrical vehicle charging points within Cleveland Police estates.</p> <p>The charging point are unable to either take payment or record which vehicle is accepting what charge. This has tax implications for both the organisation and the employee benefiting from it.</p> <p>NG asked should Cleveland look to ensure personal vehicle charging as an option for officers and staff?</p> <p>PDW – Why should anybody be allowed to charge their vehicle for free essentially?</p> <p>DS – So if you are a Police Officer with an electric car you shouldn't be able to charge it as well?</p> <p>PDW – No. Unless it is for Police business because it is an essential part of your job.</p> <p>CM – If there was a petrol pump on site you wouldn't allow police officers to go and fill the car up for nothing.</p>	

	<p>DS – The electric cars belonging to the force should have priority and be kept charged. If you are a Police officer with an electric vehicle which is never used for work, you should not be able to use those charging points.</p> <p>SS – You can charge your vehicle anywhere and get a receipt for it to be able to claim for the cost. The fairest way is to say that people, if they are using the car for work, should charge in advance and the car should be prepared to use as you would do, fill up with petrol and claim back to the set processes. And really, they should be used in one of those apps or monitors which says this is how many miles they have done so it can be authenticated.</p> <p>JF - In whole, I believe Cleveland Police should ensure that charging points are available for officers and staff to charge personal vehicles, but, this should not be a free service as it's unfair on staff members who use diesel/petrol vehicles. The only exception, that would be fair, would be if vehicles were used for operational purposes to which the cost should be reimbursed or provided at one of the electric vehicles charging points. In relation to the last question, priority should be given to vehicles used for operational purposes as its essential vehicles are readily available so we can continue to equip officers/staff to perform their duties to the best ability, without being delayed or hindered.</p> <p>Summary</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Any and all EV/Hybrid vehicles that are privately owned and not used for operational purposes should not be able to use the force charging points. 2) Privately owned EV/Hybrid vehicles used for work purposes (i.e. the owner is an essential car user) should be required to ensure the vehicle is always charged by charging at home or elsewhere, in the same way that a traditionally fuelled car is. The owner can then claim mileage allowance. 3) The force needs to take urgent action to ensure that there are sufficient supplies of charging points for force vehicles as of 2030. 	
6	<p>Matters Arising/Updates.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Youth Commission Dates <div style="text-align: center;">  <p>YAG Plan.docx</p> </div> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Feedback from Cleveland Police <p>Ethical Dilemma – Kitting out home office Summary – The key distinction here is whether someone is required to work from home or allowed to work from home. As a principle, when a person is required to WFH, there should be no barriers to providing equipment. When the person is allowed to WFH, only essential items should be provided at home – although what is essential will differ in each case.</p> <p>Ethical Dilemma – CBD in policing Summary - The Committee felt the area of CBD is lacking in terms of research and facts. The current stance of the force – that the use of CBD is discouraged, is seen</p>	

	<p>as appropriate, although reasons for the contrary can be seen. It was felt this issue should be considered further by the IEC once more scientific evidence was available.</p> <p>Ethical Dilemma – EDI & Networks Summary – Networks should have a Senior Leader affiliated in some form; however this should be in a suitable role and not overly influential. Equality between the networks should not be manufactured but is important in terms of having an appropriate voice.</p> <p>Other matters The committee discussed the Youth Ethics Panel and were keen to see linkage. It was agreed that all members should have opportunity to voice their opinion before a decision is made, but that those present support a member of the IEC to attend future Youth Ethics Panel meetings.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complaints update There are 3 different complaint models. Model 1 – all local policing bodies have responsibility for carrying out reviews where they are the relevant review body. Model 2 - handling and recording of complaints including reviews. Model 3 – all of those and also keeping the complainant updated and informed of the outcome of their complaint as a point of contact. The Police and Crime Commissioner chose model 3 which was implemented on the 31st January 2022. <p>As a result of a six-month review, we came up with some areas for development. One of the main outcomes was that the PCC is keen to achieve a customer service Excellence Award which is a performance benchmark in terms of how complaints are handled, how complainants are responded to and how the lessons learnt are implemented. The assessment will take place in September 2023.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Terms of reference The Cleveland Independent Police Ethics Committee is a forum for discussing ethical dilemmas and providing advice to Cleveland Police. Members of the Committee act as 'critical friends' to the Force and through this role the Committee seeks to enhance the trust and confidence of the public in the ethical governance and actions of the Force. In fulfilling these responsibilities, the Committee will: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monitor the Force's alignment against its values and the National Police Code of Ethics • Analyse issues and provide advice on ethical dilemmas raised by the Force, by the OPCC, members of the public and members of the Committee. • Raise and analyse issues of local and national public interest. • Promote the highest standards of ethical conduct. • Provide a focus for training in ethical issues. • Provide a source of support to Senior Leaders and others. • Interact with other groups and committees when appropriate (e.g. Independent Complaints Scrutiny Panel, Joint Audit Committee). <p>The committee to agree on a minimum number of attendees to provide an effective meeting. This was raised due to only four members being present at the meeting on the 9th August. The proposals are – 40% - 50% - 50% + 1.</p>	
--	---	--

	To be added to TOR when discussed and agreed at the next meeting.	
7	<p>Ethical Submission 2.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> AI, Ethics and Policing <p>NG provided a helpful and informative presentation regarding Artificial Intelligence, specifically how it will impact policing, and the ethical implications of this.</p> <p>SS – Thinks it would be really interesting to see from us as a committee in terms of ethics and the policies that the force is developing around these. Both in terms of developing capacity with staff because it is here and it’s going to be a way of working and investigating.</p> <p>Where are the criteria for deciding in which circumstances they will allow it to be used and when not and what are the plans for training people for investigations?</p> <p>DS – It will have implications on the OPCC as well as the police, especially if you are dealing with complaints.</p> <p>SS – There will be a place where I think the police will want to use is because it’ll be beneficial but where are the boundaries between where it is beneficial and where it’s use may be more concerning? Think the biggest challenge for policing is that the workforce is not ready for it.</p> <p>DS – I cannot imagine that the Police, at some stage, will not be using facial recognition as a process for identifying individuals. There will most definitely be a discussion around clothing etc as a means of impeding AI facial recognition and this will have a range of ethical issues for consideration. The College of Policing have given a view on this.</p> <p>SS – If you think about it in a really fundamental basic way – we all use it if you have got an iPhone. So, in terms of Policing, if you need to hack into an iPhone, you’d be going around somebody where you might want to download data as part of your investigation for an iPhone where someone uses facial recognition to log on. So, it’s already there and you know it’s happening in a way already.</p> <p>Summary</p> <p>It is important to identify the key principles that will be applied to resolving the ethical dilemmas that will face policing around AI. The IEC would be happy to contribute in that process.</p> <p>We will bring this back to further discussion at a later point.</p> <p>Policing in England and Wales: Future Operating Environment 2040 (college.police.uk)</p> <p>Live facial recognition College of Policing</p>	 <p>AI and policing for IEC.pptx</p> <p>Understanding artificial intelligence ethics and safety - GOV.UK (www.gov.uk)</p>

<p>8.</p>	<p>Ethical Dilemma 3 – Right Care Right Person</p> <p>Each Force has been asked to identify or establish an implementation plan for RCRP. Cleveland have a group which is currently working on the plan.</p> <p>DS – My concern would be that if police are only involved in the future where there is serious risk to life or criminality, and that saves 1,000,000 hours of police time, which other services are going to replace those million hours of support to people who are having a mental health crisis?</p> <p>PDW – In the event of threat to life or injury then the police will act as first responder, but they are not the right people to deal with mental health issues and should be handed over.</p> <p>SS – The principle of the right person has got to be the right one and we shouldn't be criminalizing health so the approach to step back from it is clearly a positive one and referred to what NG had said that the police got to this position almost by accident because of economic austerity policies. It is more about the process by which this happens rather than the principle.</p> <p>It's hard to argue about having the right skill set but it's about how you manage that step change to make sure it moves back into proper mental health and well-being support services.</p> <p>CM – I suppose you wouldn't know if it was a mental health issue until the police say no?</p> <p>DS – this will link to the control room decision making process in terms of deciding whether there is a threat to life etc</p> <p>JF - The rollout of Right Care, Right Person is fantastic and much needed in policing. I've personally followed the program from its early days in Humberside Police, and it's evident statistically that it's working to its core purpose. It brings the balance needed for police intervention in mental health crises and incidents. Officers are held up too much picking up the pieces of other services which prevents officers from dealing with other issues and emergency calls. The police should not be the first point of call. A large portion of these incidents dealt with by the police are health or social care matters and these people require medical support. Officers are not adequately trained to deal with these types of incidents. It's important that this innovative is fully understood by officers and staff members, especially force control room staff and frontline police officers, so they feel informed and confident in delivering it. A communications strategy needs to be well made so the public are aware too as having seen the impact of the Met's poor corporate strategy initially on the matter, this caused a lot of backlashes and uncertainties. I'm pleased to see Cleveland Police are implementing the National Right Care, Right Person project.</p> <p>Summary – The Committee support the idea of the Right Care Right Person approach. However, the process of moving towards a situation where more appropriately skilled professionals are involved needs to be carefully planned and managed. This requires clarity about when it is and is not appropriate for police officer to be involved. It is essential to ensure there is no gap in the services provided to people with mental health issues. There also needs to be a communications strategy to inform members of the public about the changes in practice.</p>	
-----------	---	--

	NG sits on the working group and is happy to be a link with to the committee.	
9.	AOB EP is developing a forward work plan for the committee which will be shared at the next meeting.	
	Date for next meeting: Thursday 26th October 2023 16:00 – 18.30 Cleveland Police HQ / Teams	